United Nations S/PV.6674 (Resumption 1)

Security Council

Sixty-sixth year

Provisional

6674th meeting

Monday, 5 December 2011, 3 p.m.
New York

President:	Mr. Churkin	(Russian Federation)
Members:	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Mr. Vukašinović
	Brazil	Mrs. Viotti
	China	Mr. Li Baodong
	Colombia	Mr. Alzate
	France	Mr. Araud
	Gabon	Mr. Moungara Moussotsi
	Germany	Mr. Wittig
	India	Mr. Hardeep Singh Puri
	Lebanon	Mr. Salam
	Nigeria	Mr. Onemola
	Portugal	Mr. Moraes Cabral
	South Africa	Mr. Mashabane
	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	Sir Mark Lyall Grant
	United States of America	Ms. Rice

Agenda

Peace and security in Africa

This record contains the text of speeches delivered in English and of the interpretation of speeches delivered in the other languages. The final text will be printed in the *Official Records of the Security Council*. Corrections should be submitted to the original languages only. They should be incorporated in a copy of the record and sent under the signature of a member of the delegation concerned to the Chief of the Verbatim Reporting Service, room U-506.

11-62209 (E)

Please recycle

The meeting resumed at 3.05 p.m.

The President (*spoke in Russian*): Members of the Council have before them document S/2011/744, which contains the text of a draft resolution submitted by Gabon and Nigeria. It is my understanding that the Council is ready to proceed to the vote on the draft resolution before it.

I shall first give the floor to those members of the Council who wish to make statements before the voting.

Mr. Moungara Moussotsi (Gabon) (*spoke in French*): The States of the Horn of Africa and other members of the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) — in particular Ethiopia, Djibouti, Somalia, Kenya and Uganda — have drawn the Council's attention to Eritrea's destabilizing activities in the subregion. Concerned about the situation, IGAD, as a subregional group, has on several occasions addressed itself to the presidency of the Security Council, in particular on 8 August.

Despite the appeals of the international community and the African Union, Eritrea has continued to fail to comply with, or implement, the relevant United Nations resolutions. For that reason, and to prevent further aggravation of tensions, IGAD has called on the Council to impose new sanctions. IGAD States have all along emphasized the need to create the conditions for lasting peace in the subregion, and any initiative to that end is therefore welcome.

In response to urgent appeals from countries of the Horn of Africa, Gabon, as an African member of the Security Council, decided to co-sponsor a draft resolution on further sanctions against Eritrea. Our commitment is also based on the decision adopted at the fourteenth ordinary session of the African Union Assembly of Heads of State and Government in January 2010, in which the African Union emphasized the need to vigorously set about implementing resolution 1907 (2009). It also called on Eritrea immediately to comply with the demands of resolutions 1862 (2009) and 1907 (2009), and called on the Security Council Sanctions Committee to implement sanctions against Eritrean police and military authorities and Eritrean leaders.

The draft resolution before the Security Council for the most part replicates the provisions of resolution 1907 (2009). New measures, contained in paragraphs 9 to 13, are essentially economic measures. Those measures have been focused to take into account the need to avoid possible negative effects on the civilian population.

Gabon therefore solemnly urges the members of the Security Council to respond to IGAD's request by adopting the draft resolution. Beyond its provisions, the draft is designed first and foremost to promote peace and improve security in Africa as a whole, and the subregion of the Horn in particular.

The President (*spoke in Russian*): I shall put the draft resolution to the vote now.

A vote was taken by show of hands.

In favour:

Bosnia and Herzegovina, Brazil, Colombia, France, Gabon, Germany, India, Lebanon, Nigeria, Portugal, South Africa, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland and United States of America

Abstaining:

China, Russian Federation

The President (*spoke in Russian*): There were 13 votes in favour, none against and two abstentions. The draft resolution has been adopted as resolution 2023 (2011).

I shall now give the floor to those members of the Council who wish to make statements after the voting.

Mr. Onemola (Nigeria): At the outset, let me say that Nigeria approaches all issues related to sanctions with the utmost gravity and consideration. We endeavoured to build consensus on this latest round of sanctions, consistent with our history as a nation that seeks to promote peaceful coexistence among nations. In 2004, as Chair of the African Union, we brought Eritrea and Ethiopia together in Algiers for direct talks aimed at resolving several conflict issues between these neighbours, including the undemarcated border between them.

Two factors informed our decision to co-sponsor resolution 2023 (2011): our unwavering commitment to peace in the Horn of Africa and Nigeria's principled position against global terrorism. We ourselves have been victims of terrorism in the recent past. The deteriorating situation in the region, especially the devastating threat of terrorism that is illuminated by the latest report of the Monitoring Group on Somalia

and Eritrea (see S/2011/433), must not be left unaddressed.

Beyond any sanctions, the opportunity for a political settlement of the myriad challenges facing the region should not be squandered. Eritrea and its neighbours — Djibouti, Ethiopia, Somalia, the Sudan and Yemen — must now repair and relaunch their relationships. The current state of suspicion and tension will only serve to undermine regional peace and progress. The Horn of Africa will require, as a matter of priority, the concerted participation and contributions of every Member State, including Eritrea, if it is to achieve comprehensive and lasting peace in the region. In light of this, we encourage Eritrea to comply with the provisions of all relevant resolutions of the Security Council.

Much as the future depends on domestic and regional political will, concerted bilateral international support can also play an important part. Thus, recognizing that in a globalized world the security of all States is intertwined, the Intergovernmental Authority on Development, the African Union, the United Nations and bilateral partners must now deploy the most serious and concerted efforts to end all conflicts in the region, including border conflicts.

The resolution we have adopted asks no more than that Eritrea fulfil its responsibility to its people as a sovereign nation and live up to its obligations as a State Member of the United Nations. We firmly believe in that possibility.

Sir Mark Lyall Grant (United Kingdom): The United Kingdom continues to be deeply concerned at the situation in the Horn of Africa and the threat to regional and international peace and security. Its people need our support now more than ever if they are to achieve a more stable and prosperous region.

The United Kingdom is concerned about Eritrea's disruptive activities in Somalia and the region, and its non-compliance with Security Council resolutions, in particular resolution 1907 (2009). The United Kingdom therefore welcomes the adoption of resolution 2023 (2011) today and the further measures it applies. We also note the Council's readiness to consider additional measures if there is evidence of further non-compliance. The measures in the resolution are proportionate, preventative and carefully targeted in order to prevent humanitarian impact, and we fully support them.

The United Kingdom urges Eritrea to comply with this and all other Security Council resolutions. We urge all States of the region to work to resolve conflict, demarcate borders and work together towards political solutions that protect civilians and provide an environment for economic development and regional integration. Given the impact on civilians of the devastating drought in the region and the famine in Somalia, we encourage these States to work together to deliver peace and security.

As resolution 2023 (2011) makes clear, the Secretary-General and the Security Council will keep Eritrea's actions under continuous review, and we shall be prepared to adjust the measures in the light of Eritrea's future compliance or non-compliance with Security Council resolutions.

Mr. Wittig (Germany): The situation in the Horn of Africa region and the role of Eritrea therein led to the adoption of resolution 1907 (2009) in December 2009, imposing sanctions on Eritrea. These sanctions have never been an end in themselves, and have not aimed at punishing the Eritrean people. Their purpose has always been to engage Eritrea in finding a peaceful solution to its problems with its neighbours.

Unfortunately, Eritrea has failed to comply with the main provisions of resolution 1907 (2009), as outlined in great detail in the report of the Monitoring Group on Somalia and Eritrea (see S/2011/433) and confirmed by the representatives of the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) this morning. We are concerned that the country continues to support armed opposition groups throughout the region, especially in Somalia. Moreover, Eritrea continues on its path to self-isolation, and has halted its cooperation with the United Nations and other organizations, such as the European Union.

The Security Council and its Committee established pursuant to resolutions 751 (1992) and 1907 (2009) discussed at length and in great depth the necessary reactions and the scope and content of a reinforced sanctions regime. Resolution 2023 (2011), which has just been adopted, bears in mind the fate of the people of Eritrea. It is calibrated and takes into account the difficult humanitarian situation in the region. It does not impose new economic sanctions or increase the burden of the Eritrean people; rather, it demands more transparency from Eritrea and calls on

those doing business with the country to make sure that funds are not used for illegitimate purposes. Resolution 2023 (2011) sends a clear political message to Eritrea that it must stop all activity that destabilizes the region, and it must cooperate with its neighbours.

In return, we call on the neighbours of Eritrea to cooperate in good faith with that country. In this respects, all forums and platforms — first and foremost, the regional organizations — should be used. We encourage IGAD to swiftly decide on Eritrea's request to reactivate its membership.

Mr. Mashabane (South Africa): The Horn of Africa faces serious challenges of instability and volatility, including threats to peace and security in Africa in general. The instability, coupled with famine, has resulted in a humanitarian crisis with dire consequences for the population of the region.

South Africa acknowledges and appreciates the important and critical role being played by the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) and the African Union are playing in the fight against armed groups and the spread of terrorism in the region. We condemn any acts by Eritrea that destabilize the region. In ensuring peace and stability that lead to the development of the region, South Africa calls on Eritrea to fully address the allegations and reports of possible support for and association with Al-Shabaab.

Two years ago, following the African Union's request, the Security Council adopted resolution 1907 (2009) in response to reports of Eritrea's role in destabilizing the region. In the implementation of the resolution, South Africa is of the view that equal attention should be given to engagement in a political process. South Africa hopes that the additional measures contained in today's resolution will not have a negative impact on the people of Eritrea or their livelihoods. We also hope that these measures and sanctions will not adversely impact the economy of Eritrea. Our proposed contribution to the resolution was to ensure that it was balanced with more clarity, did not impose collective punishment on ordinary people in Eritrea and did not contain blanket measures that would have dire consequences.

We call on the Monitoring Group to execute its responsibilities and mandate emanating from resolution 1907 (2009) and from this resolution with professionalism, impartiality and objectivity. The Monitoring Group should never be influenced by political considerations outside of its mandate. It is important for the Monitoring Group to closely guard its independence and professionalism in the work it does to assist the Security Council with the implementation of those measures. Equally, we call upon the members of the Security Council to desist from any temptation to use the Monitoring Group for political ends.

South Africa calls for the full implementation of resolution 1907 (2009). We have taken note of the fact that in the past two years, following years of self-imposed isolation, Eritrea has started a process of re-engagement with the international community and the African Union. We also welcome Eritrea's expressed desire to rejoin IGAD.

South Africa is of the strong view that sanctions should not be viewed as an end in themselves, but should complement a political process. In that regard, a political process remains critical to ensuring lasting peace in the Horn of Africa. The African Union heads of State Summit held in Malabo in July reiterated concern about the continued impasse in the peace process in that region. The African Union committed itself to assisting the countries of the region to peacefully resolve their disputes and normalize relations. We therefore continue to emphasize the importance of the centrality of an African solution to resolving African problems. In line with paragraph 2 of resolution 2023 (2011), which we have just adopted, we call on all the concerned parties in the region to work with the African Union to peacefully resolve their long-standing disputes.

South Africa supports the principle that the Security Council must always afford Member States an opportunity to be heard when their issues are addressed by the Council. We therefore appreciate the statements made this morning by the political leadership of IGAD. We are disappointed that Eritrea was not afforded an equal opportunity to address the Council today. The manner in which the Council dealt with a request by a State Member of the United Nations — in this case, Eritrea — leaves much to be desired. It is our strong view that the Council should be more sensitive and considerate when dealing with heads of State whose countries are the subject of its consideration.

We voted in favour of today's resolution in the hope that it will contribute to addressing the challenges of instability in the Horn of Africa and support the

efforts of IGAD and the African Union in consolidating peace and security in the region.

Mr. Li Baodong (China) (*spoke in Chinese*): China has closely followed the situation in the Horn of Africa and understands the concerns of the relevant countries about the security situation in the region. We oppose all words and acts that may jeopardize regional peace and stability.

China always supports the settlement of African issues in African ways by Africa. We stand for solidarity among African countries and for the appropriate settlement of their disputes through dialogue and negotiation. We hope that the African Union and other regional organizations will play a positive role in that regard. We will continue to firmly support the constructive efforts made by the relevant countries and regional organizations to maintain peace in the region. We will also continue to do what we can to offer our assistance.

China has all along adopted a prudent attitude towards sanctions, as we believe that, rather than achieving the expected results, sanctions may often lead to further complication of a situation and affect the economic development and livelihoods of the people in the countries in question. For that reason, China abstained in the voting on resolution 1907 (2009), which the Council adopted in 2009. China believes that the relevant actions by the Security Council with regard to the Horn of Africa should be conducive to improving relations among the countries of the region, the settling of disputes by the parties concerned through dialogue and negotiation, and the maintenance of regional peace and stability.

In the context of that basic principle, China took an active and constructive role in consultations on the resolution. Some of the amendments proposed by China are reflected in the text of the resolution. However, we believe that there is still room for improvement. Regrettably, the rush to vote on the resolution resulted in its ultimate failure to reflect some of the major legitimate concerns of many members of the Security Council, including China. For example, the implementation of due diligence guidelines has not yet reached maturity, and the impact of its implementation on other issues has yet to be seen. The Security Council's Sanctions Committee should have studied and explored the issue further.

It is for those reasons that China abstained in the voting on resolution 2023 (2011), which the Council has just adopted.

Mr. Salam (Lebanon) (*spoke in Arabic*): Lebanon would like to reiterate the importance of preserving the territorial unity and integrity of countries and abiding by the principle of non-aggression and non-interference in their internal affairs. We therefore once again express our full support for the Djibouti peace process and the Transitional Federal Charter, which provide the appropriate framework for reaching a lasting political agreement in Somalia. We also welcome the 9 June Kampala agreement and the road map agreed by the parties on 6 September.

Lebanon would like once again to reiterate its satisfaction with Qatar's continued mediation efforts to resolve the border conflict between Djibouti and Eritrea. We also thank Qatar for having deployed troops to the border between the two countries.

We commend the positive developments that have taken place, including the withdrawal of Eritrean forces. We call for continuing efforts to achieve objectives, in particular with regard to the Eritrea/Djibouti Border Commission and the issue of prisoners of war and missing persons. We call for compliance with resolution 1862 (2009), of 14 January 2009, as well as the agreement reached at Doha by the Governments of Djibouti and Eritrea on 6 June 2010.

However, we reiterate our great concern about the contents of the 18 July report (see S/2011/433) of the Somalia/Eritrea Monitoring Group in connection with Eritrea's actions in the Horn of Africa region, especially its support for Somali rebels. The Intergovernmental Authority on Development and leaders of neighbouring countries have issued reports of Eritrea's persistent efforts to destabilize the region — a matter that heightens our concerns. We therefore call upon Eritrea to resolve the current problems through negotiation and cooperation with IGAD, the African Union and the United Nations, and we support the draft resolution submitted by Gabon, which is backed by IGAD, as it provides a clear message of the need to implement all United Nations resolutions, to respect the principles of good neighbourliness and to deal with all pending issues through dialogue in order to strengthen peace and security in the Horn of Africa.

Ms. Rice (United States of America): The United States welcomes the Council's decision to impose new sanctions on Eritrea. Today we have sent a clear message to the Government of Eritrea that it must cease all illegal actions threatening international peace and stability in the Horn of Africa.

In adopting this resolution, we should recall the events that led us to this decision. Exactly two years ago this month, the Council adopted resolution 1907 (2009) in response to a disturbing pattern of behaviour. Eritrea was not engaging constructively in resolving its border dispute with Djibouti and most alarmingly, it was providing political, financial and logistical support to armed groups seeking to undermine peace in Somalia. The Council imposed targeted sanctions on Eritrea to demonstrate that Eritrea's actions were unacceptable and would have negative consequences.

That was two years ago. What has happened since? As we have heard again this morning, we have continued to receive evidence of Eritrean support for extremist groups in the region. Eritrea still has not resolved its border dispute with Djibouti. The United Nations Monitoring Group on Somalia and Eritrea has documented Eritrea's support for terrorism, including an appalling planned attack on the January 2011 African Union summit in Addis Ababa. According to the Monitoring Group, Eritrea is financing all of those activities through illicit means, including threats and the extortion of a diaspora tax from people of Eritrean descent living overseas.

In direct response, the Council has today imposed tougher sanctions. Our goal is to show Eritrea that it will pay an ever higher price for its actions. Building on resolution 1907 (2009), the resolution just adopted imposes new obligations on Eritrea, including the obligation to cease illicit practices aimed at extorting funds from its diaspora.

We particularly welcome the Council's expression of concern over the potential use of mining revenues to fund violations of Security Council resolutions. The United States will work with the Monitoring Group on Somalia and Eritrea and the Sanctions Committee regarding Somalia and Eritrea to develop voluntary guidelines for companies from the United States and other Member States. Such guidelines could provide useful advice, best practices and information to help companies protect themselves from inadvertently contributing to Eritrea's violations. We intend to draw on that work in advising our own companies.

In addition to the obligations set forth in this and in previous United Nations resolutions, today's resolution 2023 (2011) provides further opportunities for Eritrea to show its good faith, including by releasing information on the status of Djiboutian combatants missing in action since June 2008. Eritrea must cease all direct and indirect efforts to destabilize States, particularly through support for armed opposition and terrorist groups, and it should cooperate fully with the Monitoring Group on Somalia and Eritrea.

We hope that this tightening of sanctions will finally convince the Government of Eritrea to reorder its priorities. The United States believes that the international community's concerns can and should be resolved through political engagement and dialogue. But Eritrea must clearly and affirmatively prove, not through its words but through its actions, that it is ready to re-emerge as a law-abiding State.

Until that time, the Council and United Nations Member States are committed to enforcing robustly the sanctions we have applied. We hope that Eritrea will not squander this second chance to change course.

Mr. Araud (France) (*spoke in French*): Two years ago in December 2009, the Council adopted resolution 1907 (2009), which established a sanctions regime against Eritrea. Those sanctions were decided upon to deal with Eritrea's provision of support to armed groups that were destabilizing Somalia and as a resuly of its refusal to engage in constructive dialogue to resolve its border dispute with the Republic of Djibouti. For two years, despite the appeals of the international community, the Eritrean authorities have failed to meet the expectations of the Security Council. On the contrary, the information contained in the most recent report of the Monitoring Group on Somalia and Eritrea (S/2011/433) of the Security Council Committee established pursuant to resolutions 751 (1992) and 1907 (2009) concerning Somalia and Eritrea is a source of concern. Notably, the report indicates that Eritrea is continuing to carry out destabilizing activities in several States in the Horn of Africa.

Moreover, Eritrea has shown neither good faith nor the will necessary to find a peaceful solution to the border conflict with the Republic of Djibouti. Indeed, it

has done absolutely nothing to resolve the issue of prisoners of war, which constitutes a violation of international humanitarian law.

Given the absence of any constructive gesture from Eritrea and given that we heard this morning concerns voiced at the very highest level by the States members of the Intergovernmental Authority on Development, a gradual strengthening of sanctions is justified. That is the purpose of the resolution introduced by Gabon and Nigeria, and we thank them for having represented Africa in this African crisis.

We have ensured that the resolution will have no impact on the population of Eritrea. Its text expresses the concern of the international community at the activities of the Eritrean authorities in violation of international law and Security Council decisions, and it is intended to bring such actions to an end.

The sanctions decided upon by the Council can be reversed. Hence, we call upon Eritrea to commit itself with no further delay to an open approach. That would involve putting an end to activities that are destabilizing neighbouring countries and resuming resolute dialogue in good faith with its neighbours, in particular the Republic of Djibouti under the auspices of Qatar's mediation efforts.

The President: I will now make a statement in my national capacity as the representative of the Russian Federation.

The Russian delegation abstained in the voting on the resolution of the Security Council submitted by Gabon and Nigeria on strengthening sanctions against Eritrea. However, we understand the many concerns expressed today in the statements by the representatives of member States of the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD).

The text of the resolution contains a range of provisions that lack adequate foundation, and the role of the group of experts has been expanded beyond measure. In that respect we refer in particular to the "planned terrorist attack" in Addis Ababa during the African Union summit there. The Russian Federation is categorically against terrorism in all its forms and manifestations. However, in this case, the Security Council was not presented with convincing proof of Eritrea's involvement in that incident.

We have not seen the results of any investigation of that incident, if indeed there was one. We also have doubts with respect to the provision in the resolution that gives the Sanctions Committee a mandate to draft, with the support of the expert group, guiding principles for States on maintaining vigilance in their cooperation with Eritrea in the mining sector. When it comes to guiding United Nations Members, guidance should be provided by a resolution of the Security Council and not by the preliminary work of subsidiary bodies, as that can lead to various interpretations of resolutions that have been adopted.

Practical implementation of the provisions of the resolution regarding the Eritrean diaspora raises further questiond. In general, we are concerned by a trend in the recent work of the Council of including ambiguous language in the texts of draft resolutions, which impedes their implementation in practice. It should be noted that resorting to sanctions should be seen as an extreme measure. It is very important that we exhaust the political and diplomatic means available before resorting to sanctions.

We believe that settlement of the problem in the Horn of Africa involves establishing a broad and multifaceted dialogue among the countries of the region. We call upon Eritrea and its neighbours to openly and transparently discuss all of the key issues in an effort to improve the situation in that area of the African continent.

I now resume my functions as President of the Security Council.

There are no more names inscribed on the list of speakers. The Security Council has thus concluded the present stage of its consideration of the item on its agenda. The Security Council will remain seized of the matter.

The meeting rose at 3.40 p.m.